

January 23, 2013 10:40 pm

# Wrong kind of austerity was better than none at all

*From Profs Alberto Alesina and Francesco Giavazzi.*

Sir, “My best guess is that history will accord [Mario Monti] a role similar to that played by Heinrich Brüning, Germany’s chancellor from 1930 to 1932. He, too, was part of a prevailing establishment consensus that there was no alternative to austerity,” writes Wolfgang Münchau (Comment, January 21). We disagree.

Let’s keep some perspective. The alternative to a reduction of the budget deficit would not have been – in Italy like in other euro area countries – more growth, but even higher interest rates, possibly a restructuring of the debt and even weaker bank balance sheets – in other words, a return to the conditions prevailing in the winter of 2008. This being said, there are different ways to implement fiscal austerity.

The empirical evidence – assuming someone still cares – shows that spending cuts, accompanied by labour and product market liberalisations, are much less costly than tax hikes, in some cases implying no cost at all. Mr Monti – our former colleague at Bocconi University – should have pursued fiscal austerity differently: cutting spending, rather than just raising taxes. But to say that he should have done nothing – maybe even raise spending a bit – when Italian interest rates were 600 basis points higher than German rates, borders on the irresponsible. And we are surprised that the FT would agree to publish such a view.

**Alberto Alesina, Harvard University, US**

**Francesco Giavazzi, Bocconi University, Italy**

You may be interested in

Why Monti is not the right man to lead Italy

Clear message to Merkel turned out to be highly effective

Italian yields began to fall as soon as Berlusconi was ousted

Monti's support for the euro made the ECB's intervention possible

A personal virulent opposition to Europe's success

Republicans weigh interim debt-limit hike

Nationalism is a virus, federalism the cure

Take a stand on being more productive

Britain has a funny way of firing up the locomotive

The careerist: Working with gossips

Editor's notes

The road to recognition

Beat Memories: The Photographs of Allen Ginsberg,